ELECTRONICALLY FILED

USDC SDNY DOCUMENT

DATE FILED:

DOC #:



111 N. Wabash Ave. Suite 1010 Chicago, IL 60602 (312) 450-6600 tel (312) 450-6601 fax www.nccusl.org

09

OFFICERS
ROBERT A. STEIN
President
University of Minnesota Law School
229 19th Ave. S.
Minneapolis, MN 55455

JAMES A WYNN, JR. Vice President North Carolina Court of Appeals One West Morgan St. P.O. Box 888 Raleigh, NC 27802

RICHARD T. CASSIDY Secretary 100 Main St. P.O. Box 1124 Burtington, VT 05402

CHARLES A. TROST Treasurer Nashville City Center 511 Union St., Suite 2700 Nashville, TN 37219

EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE MICHAEL HOUGHTON Cheir P.O. Box 1347

P.O. Box 1347 1201 N. Market St., 18th Floor Wilmington, OE 19899

TERRY J. CARE 2300 W. Sahara, Suite 1000 Las Vegas, NV 89102

LANI LIU EWART 1099 Alakea St., Suite 1800 Honolulu, HI 96813

DALE G, HIGER 1302 Warm Springs Ave. Boise, ID 83712

#### EX OFFICIO MEMBERS

President Vice President Secretary Treasurer

MARTHA LEE WALTERS Immediate Past President Oregon Supreme Court 1163 State St. Salem, OR 97301.

HARRIET LANSING
Chair, Scope and Program Committee
313 Judical Center
25 Rev Dr. Martin Luther
King Jr. Bivd.
St. Paul, MN 55155

ROBERT J. TENNESSEN Chair, Legislative Committee 2427 West 21 St. Minneapolis, MN 55405

STAFF
JOHN A. SEBERT
Executive Director
iohn.sebert@nccusl.org

J. ELIZABETH COTTON-MURPHY
Chief Administrative Officer
elizabeth.cotton@nccusl.org

MICHAEL R. KERR
Legislative Director / Legal Counsel
michael.ker@nccusl.org

UNIFORM LAW FOUNOATION TIMOTHY BERG Chair

3003 N. Central Ave. Suite 2600 Phoenix, AZ 85012 September 3, 2009

Attention: The Honorable Judge Denny Chin

Office of the Clerk
J. Michael McMahon
U.S. District Court for the Southern District of New York
500 Pearl Street
New York, New York, 10007

Re: The Authors Guild et al. v Google, Inc., Case No. 1:05-CV-8136-DC (S.D.N.Y.) Objections of NCCUSL and ALI to the GBS

Dear Judge Chin:

The Uniform Law Commission ("ULC"), also known as the National Conference of Commissioners on Uniform State Laws, does not wish to opt out of the proposed Google Book Settlement ("GBS"). However, the ULC joins with the American Law Institute ("ALI") in objecting to the GBS with respect to its application to the Uniform Commercial Code ("UCC") and all commentary, drafts, annotations, and other materials related thereto. The ULC has Class Member standing as a member of both the Provisionally Certified Publisher Sub-Class and the Provisionally Certified Author Sub-Class. ULC is a non-profit state governmental organization based in Chicago, Illinois.

The ULC does not object to inclusion in the settlement generally, and this notice of objection is limited to titles and works relating to the UCC.

### I. About the ULC

Founded in 1892, the ULC provides states with non-partisan, well-conceived and well-drafted legislation that brings clarity and stability to critical areas of the law. NCCUSL's work supports the federal system and facilitates the movement of individuals and the business of organizations with rules that are consistent from state to state.

Uniform Law Commissioners must be lawyers, qualified to practice law. They are lawyer-legislators, attorneys in private practice, state and federal judges, law professors, and legislative staff attorneys, who have been appointed by state governments as well as the District of Columbia, Puerto Rico and the U.S. Virgin Islands to research, draft and promote enactment of uniform state laws in areas where uniformity is desirable and practical.

# II. The GBS generally

The work of the ULC, at its core, is to research and draft state laws on a wide variety of subject, and to develop commentary, forms, and other supplemental materials for use by states and legal practitioners. On the whole, we welcome the possibility of Google providing a broad, additional, and nonexclusive distribution channel for our copyrighted works, and thus we do not object to the application of the GBS to the majority of our acts, drafts, commentaries, and other materials.

# III. Application of the GBS to the UCC

However, with respect to application of the GBS to the UCC, we are compelled to join in the objections of the ALI. The ULC and the ALI have worked together on the UCC since the mid 1940's. As specified in several agreements between our two organizations, the copyright for the UCC is to be jointly held, with proceeds supporting the ongoing work of the Permanent Editorial Board for the UCC and the participation of representatives from both entities in the development of that body of work. These are not "commercially unavailable" products; all of the articles of the UCC have been revised in the past 15 years, and a number of current development projects are currently underway. While we are not urging the GBS to be rejected as a whole, we do agree with the ALI that any settlement should be fair and equitable to all members of the Class, avoid unintended consequences to third parties, and limit any reordering of fundamental intellectual property rights. For that reason we join in the ALI's concerns with respect to the works of the UCC.

## IV. Conclusion

While the ULC does not wish to opt-out of the settlement, and are generally satisfied with the application of the GBS to most of our included works, we share the concerns of the ALI with respect to the Uniform Commercial Code.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert A. Stein, President **Uniform Law Commission** 

September 3, 2009

Roberta Cooper Ramo, President cc: American Law Institute